



PROJECT MUSE®

---

*Oaxaca in Motion: An Ethnography of Internal, Transnational,  
and Return Migration* by Iván Sandoval-Cervantes (review)

Aaron Malone

Journal of Latin American Geography, Volume 22, Number 1, May 2023,  
pp. 190-192 (Article)

Published by University of Texas Press



➔ For additional information about this article

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/899567>

**Iván Sandoval-Cervantes***Oaxaca in Motion: An Ethnography of Internal, Transnational, and Return Migration.*

Austin, TX: University of Texas Press, 2022. ix + 117 pp. Illustrations, maps, notes, references, index. \$27.95 paperback (ISBN 978-1477326053).

**T**HERE IS MUCH TO RECOMMEND IN THIS slim volume. The book is a multisited ethnography built around the rural Oaxacan community of Zegache and tracing community members' internal and international migration trajectories. Cultural change is a central focus, specifically analyzing how gender norms evolve and are reproduced in relation to men's and women's mobility. The book does not have the level of detail (or length) often associated with ethnographies, but it still works, with Iván Sandoval-Cervantes centering community members' voices and stories in a concise and insightful style.

One of the book's strengths is the explicit weaving together of internal and international migration—topics that are too often treated separately. Drawing from anthropologist Lynn Stephen's work, Sandoval-Cervantes uses the term “transborder” to reflect the multiplicity of meaningful borders crossed—not only international, but also class, ethnic, regional, and others. Analyzing outward from a single community with diverse migration and mobility patterns brings the internal/international connections and transborder perspective into clear view. Central examples include men's internal migration through joining the Mexican military, women's internal migration to work in Mexico City's domestic services sector, and men's and women's different trajectories of international migration to the U.S. West Coast. The book also engages the experiences of non-migrants, return

migrants, and rural-to-urban commuters to further broaden the scope of consideration of mobility and migration, and emphasizes individuals' multiple experiences across the course of their lives. Interestingly, the author notes that Zegacheños's own narratives often use the same internal/international dichotomies that are critiqued as methodological nationalism in migration studies, with only those who have lived in the U.S. referred to locally as migrants.

Another strength is the book's comprehensive analysis of cultural change around gender. Sandoval-Cervantes examines how gender norms shape migration and mobility as well as how migration and mobility influence gender norms—both reinforcing and challenging them, at times—while remaining sensitive to generational changes that intersect with but are also distinct from migration influences. Patriarchal norms valorize men's mobility as productive, and men rework and expand repertoires of masculinity to incorporate activities outside the traditional realm. Specifically, Sandoval-Cervantes describes a “piece-rate masculinity” (p. 66) that emerged from incorporation into the U.S. agro-industrial sector, and a reframing of cooking as a “manly activity” (p. 73) derived from experiences in the military or working in U.S. restaurants. Even as masculinity is expanded and reworked, themes of sacrifice and risk remain central pillars.

Women's mobility is also powerfully influ-

enced by patriarchal norms, which are modified and challenged but, in the end, remain largely intact. Women's care work obligations shape mobility patterns, most notably with acceptance of internal migration—which is seen as more temporary, allowing flexibility if needed to return to care for family members or in situations of crisis—whereas international migration of single women is frowned upon. In the case of the decades-old pattern of female migration for domestic work in Mexico City, these women experience more freedom and learn to navigate the city solo, or rely on networks of other women migrants, which can pose greater challenges to gender norms than those emerging from international migration. However, women returning from Mexico City often face strong stigmas that could counteract the challenges they pose (intentionally or not) to traditional gender norms.

Sandoval-Cervantes also analyzes the triad of mother-in-law-wife-husband as a key point in which norms of femininity are policed and reproduced, and one that is strongly influenced by migration. Married women are still typically subjected to the “tutelage” of their mother-in-law (p. 82), but the dynamics evolve when husbands are away in the United States, when husband and wife both are in the United States, or as women work outside the home or commute to nearby cities. In the end, though, Sandoval-Cervantes's analyses of both men and women demonstrate the durability of patriarchal norms, as men have expanded and reinforced fairly traditional notions of masculinity while women remain constrained by expectations around care work, despite many other changes. Moreover, women who have challenged traditional roles

face stigma and backlash.

Another strength of the book is its engagement with forces at many scales, which interact with the life of the town and its residents' mobility and migration patterns. For example, men have joined the military within the twin contexts of Mexico's (U.S.-supported) war on drugs that expanded opportunities to enlist, and the structural adjustments that diminished the viability of subsistence agricultural livelihoods. Women's migration to Mexico City follows networks that emerged during the so-called Mexican Miracle economic boom, while men's (and later women's) migration to Oregon and the U.S. West Coast leveraged connections from nearby towns with longer migration histories—connections that were strengthened as local road networks were expanded. Expanding road networks also shifted local opportunity structures, opening the possibility of daily commuting to Oaxaca City for work or study. Sandoval-Cervantes weaves these dynamics insightfully within the multi-generational, multisite analysis of migration and gender that is his central focus.

While this book has little to critique, a few areas merit brief mention. First, though the author notes that Indigenous identity is less prominent in Zegache compared to many Oaxacan communities (p. 51), the minimal analysis of indigeneity still feels like a missed opportunity, especially in light of the explicit transborder focus (i.e. borders around ethnicity and language). Related to that point, while the author reflects on his own positionality as an outsider and a man—including comments on his gender-sensitive data collection approach (p. 26)—he does not reflect on

the class and ethnic dimensions of his relationship to the study community.

In sum, *Oaxaca in Motion* makes a strong contribution to the literature on migration, mobility, and gender, including advancing the trend to reintegrate the fields of internal and international migration. The writing style is concise and narrative-driven, with analysis that situates the work within the literature

but does not belabor the point nor delve deep into theory. As such, it would make excellent reading for undergraduate or graduate courses, providing a case study through which students can see migration and gender theories (which they will have read about elsewhere) in action.

**Aaron Malone**

*Colorado School of Mines*

---

**David S. Dalton and Douglas J. Weatherford (Eds.)**

*Healthcare in Latin America: History, Society, Culture.*

Gainesville, FL: University of Florida Press, 2022. 318 pp. Figures, tables, contributors, index.

\$95 hardcover (13-9781683402619); \$35 paperback (13-9781683403258).

**H***healthcare in Latin America: History, Society, Culture* provides readers with a sampling of the myriad ways we can approach understanding health care and health care access in Latin America. At the same time, it also provides granular analyses of particular systems, histories, practices, and trends. The collection is mostly, but not exclusively, concerned with public health, that is to say, how government policies have shaped populations and health. The authors come from diverse fields, including history, public health, sociology, and language and cultural studies. This interdisciplinary line-up leads to eclectic questions, approaches, and data sets; analyses of historical and cultural archives; examination of health data, policies, and statistics; descriptions of the intersections of health and economic policies; textual analysis; and interpretation of films.

The temporal frame is long, spanning pre-Columbian healers (Chapter 1, *Healthcare and Doctors*, by Jethro Hernández

Berrones) to twenty-first-century discourses on transgender health care access in Colombia (Chapter 13, *Transness and Disability in Discourses of Access to Healthcare in the Colombian Press*, by Javier E. García León and David L. García León). The editors state that they wanted the volume to take up Marco Cueto and Steven Palmer's call (in *Medicine and Public Health in Latin America*, 2015) to provide a "fluid dialogue" (p. 4) among various disciplines, and in that they have been very successful. I know of no other volume on health and health care that takes this approach, making this volume a unique and thought-provoking contribution.

The volume is organized geographically, with sections on Mexico; Latino/a/x communities in the United States; Central America and the Caribbean; the Andean region; and the Southern Cone. Given this, of course, we come to know some areas much better than others. Mexico gets the most comprehensive treatment, with four chap-